Workforce 2030: The WHO Global Strategy on Human Resources for Health and the High-Level Commission on Health Employment & Economic Growth

Jim Campbell
Director, Health Workforce, World Health Organization
Executive Director, Global Health World Health Alliance
Geneva, Switzerland
@JimC_HRH

World Health Professions Regulation Conference 2016
Geneva, Switzerland
May 22, 2016
Overview

1. Workforce 2030: Background (2013-2016)

2. 69th World Health Assembly:
   • A69/38. Global Strategy on Human Resources for Health: Workforce 2030
   • A69/38. Draft Resolution
   • A69/37. Global Code of Practice on the International Recruitment of Health Personnel
   • A69/36. Health workforce and services

3. High-Level Commission on Health Employment & Economic Growth
“Investing in new health workforce employment opportunities may also add broader socio-economic value to the economy and contribute to the implementation for the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development”

United Nations General Assembly resolution A/RES/70/183
December 2015
**SDGs – Goal 3**

**SDG 3: Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages**

**Target 3.8:** Achieve universal health coverage, including financial risk protection, access to quality essential health-care services, medicines and vaccines for all

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MDG unfinished and expanded agenda</th>
<th>New SDG 3 targets</th>
<th>SDG3 means of implementation targets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1: Reduce maternal mortality</td>
<td>3.4: Reduce mortality from NCD and promote mental health</td>
<td>3.a: Strengthen implementation of framework convention on tobacco control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2: End preventable newborn and child deaths</td>
<td>3.5: Strengthen prevention and treatment of substance abuse</td>
<td>3.b: Provide access to medicines and vaccines for all, support R&amp;D of vaccines and medicines for all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3: End the epidemics of HIV, TB, malaria and NTD and combat hepatitis, waterborne and other communicable diseases</td>
<td>3.6: Halve global deaths and injuries from road traffic accidents</td>
<td>3.c: Increase health financing and health workforce (especially in developing countries)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7: Ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health-care services</td>
<td>3.9: Reduce deaths from hazardous chemicals and air, water and soil pollution and contamination</td>
<td>3.d: Strengthen capacity for early warning, risk reduction and management of health risks</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Interactions with economic, other social and environmental SDGs and SDG 17 on means of implementation**
A new emphasis......

Broader than SDG3. Not a ‘cost’ but an investment:

1. The health and social sectors + scientific and technological industries act as an engine of **inclusive economic growth**, boosting skills, innovation, **decent jobs** and **formal employment**, especially among **women and youth**. SDGs: 4 (education), 5 (gender equality), 8 (economic growth & employment), 9 (innovation).

2. The foundation for the equitable distribution of essential promotive, preventive, curative and palliative services that are required to maintain and **improve population health** and remove people from poverty. SDGs 1 (poverty), 2 (nutrition), 3 (healthy lives).

3. The **first line of defence** to meet core capacity requirements on the International Health Regulations (2005) & Global Health Security. SDGs 3 (healthy lives), 9 (resilient infrastructure).
69th World Health Assembly:

1. A69/36. Health workforce and services
4. Global Strategy – DRAFT for 69th WHA
5. A69/CONFxx. Draft Resolution
1. **Optimize the existing workforce** in pursuit of the Sustainable Development Goals and UHC (e.g. education, employment, retention)

2. **Anticipate future workforce** requirements by 2030 and plan the necessary changes (e.g. a fit for purpose, needs-based workforce)

3. **Strengthen individual and institutional capacity** to manage HRH policy, planning and implementation (e.g. migration and regulation)

4. **Strengthen the data, evidence and knowledge** for cost-effective policy decisions (e.g. National Health Workforce Accounts)
Milestones to 2020:

- All countries have inclusive **institutional mechanisms** in place to coordinate an intersectoral health workforce agenda.
- All countries have a human resources for health unit with responsibility for **development and monitoring of policies and plans**.
- All countries have **regulatory mechanisms** to promote patient safety and adequate oversight of the private sector.
- All countries have established **accreditation mechanisms** for health training institutions.
- All countries are making progress on **health workforce registries** to track health workforce stock, education, distribution, flows, demand, capacity and remuneration.
- All countries are making progress on sharing data on human resources for health through **national health workforce accounts** and submit core indicators to the WHO Secretariat annually.
Relevant text (examples):

• **19.** Dramatic improvement in efficiency can be attained by strengthening the ability of national institutions to devise and implement more effective strategies and appropriate regulation for the health workforce.

• **34.** Governments to collaborate with professional councils and other regulatory authorities to adopt regulation that takes into account transparency, accountability, proportionality, consistency, and that is targeted to the population’s needs. Advancing this agenda requires strengthening the capacity of regulatory and accreditation authorities. Regulatory bodies should play a central role in ensuring that public and private sector professionals are competent sufficiently experienced and adhere to agreed standards relative to the scope of practice and competency enshrined in regulation and legislative norms;
Global Strategy HRH: Workforce 2030...

Regulatory research and its application

Optimizing scope of practice, differentiation and articulation of roles as well as increased deployment of APRN roles

Innovative use of technology and new models of care delivery

Leadership development and succession planning

System wide risk based regulatory approaches

Policy, legislative and political competencies

Econometric Evaluations of roles and their impact on the total economy

Regulatory impact assessment & regulatory body performance measures

Strategic and operational planning & benchmarking as a byproduct of service delivery

Workforce planning and large scale data analytics

Real time regulatory and workforce data

Health and social care partnership working

Objective 1

Objective 2

Objective 3

Objective 4

Regulatory perspective

Source: David Benton, CEO, NCSBN, with permission
• (PP10). Deeply concerned by the **rising global health workforce deficit** and the mismatch between the supply, demand, and population need for health workers...

• (PP12) Encouraged by the emerging political consensus on the **contribution of health workers** to **improved health outcomes**, to **economic growth**, to implementation of the International Health Regulations and to **global health security**;

• (PP13) Recognizing that investing in **new health workforce employment opportunities** may also **add broader socioeconomic value** to the economy and contribute to the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals,

(OP 1). to implement policy options as proposed for Member States by the Global Strategy, supported by high-level commitment and adequate financing......

- (a) strengthening respective capacities to optimize the existing health workforce to contribute to the achievement of universal health coverage;
- (b) actively forecasting and addressing gaps between health workforce needs, demands, and supply, including through intersectoral collaboration;

Co-sponsored by:

Argentina, Japan, Mozambique, Norway, South Africa, Switzerland, Thailand, United States of America, Zambia, Zimbabwe and European Union Member States

A69/CONF/xx : A foundation for action

• (OP 3). education institutions to adapt their institutional set-up and modalities of instruction, aligned with national accreditation systems and populations’ health needs; to train health workers in sufficient quantity, quality, and with relevant skills, while also promoting gender equality in admissions and teaching; and to maintain quality and enhance performance through continuing professional development programmes;

• professional councils, associations, and regulatory bodies to adopt regulations to optimize workforce competencies, and to support inter-professional collaboration for a skills mix responsive to population needs;

Co-sponsored by: Argentina, Japan, Mozambique, Norway, South Africa, Switzerland, Thailand, United States of America, Zambia, Zimbabwe and European Union Member States

(3) the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank, etc to adapt their macroeconomic policies in light of mounting evidence that *health workers are productive to economic and social development*.

(4) development partners...to augment, coordinate, and *align their investments in education, employment, health, gender, and labour* in support of *national health workforce priorities*;

(5) global health initiatives to ensure that all grants include *an assessment of health workforce implications*...and contribute to efficient investment in... *national health workforce policies*;

Co-sponsored by: Argentina, Japan, Mozambique, Norway, South Africa, Switzerland, Thailand, United States of America, Zambia, Zimbabwe and European Union Member States

REQUESTS the Director-General:

- (1) to provide support to Member States...on the implementation and monitoring of the Global Strategy,
- (c) support Member States in... the consolidation of a core set of health workforce data with annual reporting...the progressive implementation of National Health Workforce Accounts;
- (2) to include an assessment of health workforce implications of technical resolutions brought before the World Health Assembly and Regional Committees;

Co-sponsored by:

Argentina, Japan, Mozambique, Norway, South Africa, Switzerland, Thailand, United States of America, Zambia, Zimbabwe and European Union Member States

No health workforce, No global health security.

Since the recent epidemics of Ebola, MERS, and Zika viruses, the ever-present threat of pandemics, influenza, and now the menace of a yellow fever crisis, the notion of global health security has risen to the top of concerns facing the 194 member states attending next week's 69th World Health Assembly (WHA) in Geneva, Switzerland. Without global health security, the common goal of a more sustainable and resilient society for human health and wellbeing will be unsustainable.

But what is global health security? Much attention has rightly been devoted to the International Health Regulations—an international agreement “to prevent, protect against, control, and provide a public health response to the international spread of disease.” But, as David Heymann and colleagues outlined in a series of essays on global health security and the wider lessons from the west African Ebola epidemic published in The Lancet last year, there can be no global health security without individual health security. There is a clear need to go beyond rapid detection and response to reduce collective vulnerability to cross-border infectious disease threats, and to ensure individuals have access to safe and effective health care. For Heymann and colleagues “Collective health security is the sum of individual health security.” And what is the most important determinant of individual health security? In one word, people. Or, more programmatically, skilled health professionals.

Next week’s WHA is therefore crucially important, as we set out in an Editorial last month. Member states will discuss a new draft Global Strategy on Human Resources for Health: Workforce 2030. This strategy has been a decade in the making—a decade, some critics might say, of failure. In 2005, the World Health Report Working Together for Health identified the shortages of skilled health professionals as a central challenge for the health-related Millennium Development Goals. During the past 5 years, the WHA has adopted five resolutions on human resources for health. Last year, “recruitment, development, training, and retention of the health workforce” was adopted in target 3c of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The new draft Global Strategy aims to accelerate progress towards universal health coverage and the SDGs by ensuring the equitable availability of and access to high-quality health workers. Importantly, the draft Global Strategy provides updated projections on the health workforce required to accelerate and sustain progress towards universal health coverage. It estimates that the global needs-based shortage of health-care workers will be more than 14 million by 2030, and offers a needs-based “SDG index” of minimum density of doctors, nurses, and midwives (4.5 per 1000 population as a minimum threshold to meet SDG targets).

Adopting a strategy is one thing. Implementation is another. Even the most optimistic observer must conclude that efforts to strengthen the health workforce over the past decade have fallen seriously short of expectations. This is no time for complacency. We see two opportunities for advancing human security with the health workforce at its core, thereby turning aspirations into actions. First, this month’s G7 meeting in Japan (May 26–27), where Prime Minister Shinzo Abe will make human security a key part of his G7 agenda. Protecting human security has been a core concept of Japanese foreign policy for many years—as stressed in Koji Shibuya and colleagues’ Health Policy article published in this week’s issue. And second, the recently created Commission on Health Employment and Economic Growth, jointly chaired by Presidents Hollande (France) and Zuma (South Africa), which has been tasked with proposing actions to guide the creation of health-sector jobs as a means to advance inclusive economic growth. It will report in September at the UN General Assembly in New York, USA.

Global health security depends on many factors—robust disease surveillance systems, reliable health information, prevention, diagnostic, and treatment services, financing, and strong political commitment. But without skilled health professionals, who should be valued and protected everywhere, to act as the first line of defence of individual health security, other efforts will be in vain. That is why we endorse the workforce 2030 strategy and hope that WHO’s member states will too. There can be no health security without a skilled health workforce. That is the lesson of Ebola that remains to be learned. • The Lancet
Building multi-sectoral engagement...

- Part 3: High-Level Commission on Health Employment & Economic Growth
“We believe that this Commission proposes a major political and paradigm shift to promote investment in the health sector in order to stimulate inclusive and sustainable economic growth and productive employment and decent work, in addition to ensuring healthy lives and well-being.”

Communiqué, 23 March 2016

http://www.who.int/hrh/com-heeg/en/
Decent work, inclusive economic growth, UHC

**Health as a cost disease and a drag on the economy**

- Baumol (1967)
  - Growth in health sector employment without increase in productivity could constrain economic growth (data from USA)

- Hartwig (2008 and 2011)
  - Confirmation of Baumol hypothesis (data from OECD countries)

**Health as a multiplier for inclusive economic growth**

- Arcand et al., World Bank (*In press*, 2016)
  - larger dataset; data from low-, middle- and high-income countries
  - establishes positive and significant growth inducing effect of health sector employment; multiplier effect on other economic sectors
  - magnitude of effect greater than in other recognized growth sectors
Workforce 2030: Source of employment....(OECD)

Growth in health and social sector employment throughout the economic downturn

Around 42 million people across 34 countries of the Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD) were unemployed in May 2015, 10 million more than before the financial crisis (OECD Employment Outlook 2015)
More than 6 million jobs in 2012, i.e. every 7th German is working in the health economy. In the health economy 700,000 new jobs were created since 2005.

Source: Prof. Dr. Klaus-Dirk Henke | The Economic and Health Dividend of Health Care and Health. 2013
Workforce 2030: Women’s economic participation

Source: Magar et al, WHO, based on ILOSTAT (forthcoming 2016)
Meeting of the High-Level Commission on Health Employment and Economic Growth. Lyon, France - 23 March 2016

“We expect that this Commission will make recommendations on education and training models, as well as on the range of skills required….to ensure that health workers’ competencies are in line with the needs of populations, taking into account epidemiologic and demographic changes, and in particular ageing and non-communicable diseases”.

http://www.who.int/hrh/com-heeg/en/
THANK YOU